

Navajo (Tuba City) Federally Recognized Tribal Extension Program Ripple Effects Mapping Findings

The Indian Land Tenure Foundation (ILFT) engaged in a joint collaboration with an evaluation team and the Western Extension Risk Management Education Center to measure the long-term impacts of the Federally Recognized Tribal Extension Program (FRTEP) serving the Navajo (Tuba City) Tribe. In order to collect this information, the evaluation team used a tool called Ripple Effects Mapping (REM). REM is a storytelling technique that is used to collect stories and experiences from community members. The results at the completion of a Ripple Effects Mapping included both a visual map and a set of narratives that were subsequently analyzed.

The data from 31 FRTEP programs was summarized into a final report – *“Mapping FRTEP Impacts in Indian Country”* and published in March 2022 for the purpose of demonstrating the collective value of the programs. This report can be found [Measuring FRTEP's success - Tribal Extension](#)

In May 2021, a virtual Ripple Effects Mapping event was held with Navajo (Tuba City) Tribal members and others in the community who benefited from FRTEP programs or were aware of the impact of this programming. Those participating in the online event may have included farmers/ranchers, community members including agency and/or Tribal leadership, high school students, 4-H members, and others. Tribal and community members joined either online or by phone.

During the session, participants had the opportunity to tell us stories about how they have benefited from having FRTEP in their community. A facilitator led the conversation, asking each Tribal and/or community member to share their story one at a time. Questions participants were asked to consider included:

1. *Tell us a story about how one of these programs has had an impact on your Tribal community.*
2. *Are you or your family doing anything differently as a result of these programs?*
3. *What has been a personal benefit to you or your family because of these programs?*
4. *What has been the most helpful part of these programs for you, your family, or your Tribal community?*

As individuals spoke, their stories were both recorded and mapped into digital mapping software in order to visually display the impact. No individual's names are included in this data set or the final report mentioned above. Following the REM, those stories were analyzed using the FRTEP priority program areas to determine the ways in which the FRTEP has impacted the Tribe and surrounding community. Additionally, the data was also analyzed to understand ways in which the COVID-19 pandemic has had an impact on programming.

This report includes all of the stories collected from the Navajo (Tuba City) Tribe.

- Page 2 shows examples of ways you can use this information.
- Page 3 summarizes in themes and subthemes the ways in which the FRTEP program and you as the FRTEP educator/agent had impact in your Tribal community.
- Pages 4-7 includes these themes and all of the stories collected from your REM event.
- Page 8 is an image of the full REM Map, which is also attached as a PDF for reprinting. Additionally, a laminated poster of your REM MAP is being mailed to you, to share with community members, Tribal leaders and others vested in your programs.

If you would like to have an opportunity to discuss in further detail and/or have questions, we can set up a Zoom meeting with one of the Ripple Effects Mapping team members.

Rebecca Sero, r.sero@outlook.com;

Debra Hansen, debra.ann.hansen@gmail.com; and

JoAnn Warner, warnerj@wsu.edu

How you can use your Ripple Effects Mapping data:

Storytelling is a powerful technique that can be used in many different ways. Your stories from REM helped us understand the impacts and value of FRTEP that can be shared with funders, Tribal members and leadership. More than numbers, stories can reveal needs, achievements and emotional real-life impacts. Your story examples can be used multiple ways to elevate the importance of the work that you are doing and to demonstrate the collective impact that it is having in your community

Here are three ways you can use the two edited story examples (below) while also utilizing the report's themes and subthemes to demonstrate the impacts this program is having:

Within the Community

- Stories can be shared or incorporated into community celebrations and/or events.
- Communicated to your Advisory Committee to help build capacity for future programming.

In Reports

- Prepared reports Tribal Council members and other community leaders with story examples, themes and subthemes that show how FRTEP is working to accomplish the priority areas established by the Tribal Advisory Council; and which relay the benefits, impacts and other indicators of success as a result of FRTEP.
- Prepared reports for your 1862 Land Grant University or your 1994 Tribal College or University leadership with story examples embedded and that include the themes and sub themes from each of the program's priority areas. Highlight how the Ripple Effects Mapping session empowered community members to share their stories and the benefits inherent in discovering the successes brought about by the program

In Grant Applications

- Having a solid evaluation plan is critical to writing a successful grant application. Including outcomes from the Ripple Effects Mapping demonstrates the long-lasting impacts of FRTEP and uses a culturally appropriate approach to do so.

In summary, the stories and data that you have collected through the Ripple mapping process can be used many different ways to communicate your successes and to elevate your program not only at the community level – but also to your stakeholder partners, collaborators and other individuals, organizations and entities, for the purpose of strengthening and building the capacity of FRTEP.

Themes and Subthemes

For the Navajo (Tuba City) Tribe and community, the impacts, effects, and benefits could all be found within the following five program priority areas and subthemes are listed here. On pages 4-7, you will see the same priority areas, subthemes with individual stories collected directly from the transcript.

1. Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement

- Professional Development

2. Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management

- Support for Farmers
- Support for Ranchers
- Support for Future and New Farmers and Ranchers

3. Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction

- Healthy Food Choices

4. Tribal Youth and 4-H

- Life skills

Overall

- Cultural Understanding and Respect

Themes, Subthemes and Stories

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement	Professional development	My idea about horseshoeing is that I want to be able to open a person's mind and get him to do a trim by the end of the day, or from that day on he can trim his own horse. I had to get a way to teach somebody that has no clue about hoofs to a point where they can do their own trim. So that's what I did, and then at the same time, with the help of [the agent], we did quite a few through the years. I think six years, six or seven years on, maybe 10, almost every summer different areas we did. So, with the teaching from [FRTEP], it just opened my mind to everything, to what I was doing was the right thing.
Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement	Professional development	I think [FRTEP programs have] a lot of impact. The older I'm getting, there's a lot of youths that we started with when they were around nine. They're in high schools now, so about 15, 16 years old, and you see them with horses and what they're doing in their life, and they're pointing towards [studying and working in] agriculture. It seems like we plant seeds at the right time, so they're going into the livestock and then they go to farming, and things like that you see. And then on the adult side, the young adults, they're doing their own trimming, their own shoeing, and then they're going into more of horse shoeing. And then as far as taking care of their horses, how to feed them. You can see it into the youth, and junior rodeos. Some of them are into the rodeos to the point where they're into the pros. Yeah, we have a world champion in roping from [a reservation community], we're really proud of him.
Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement	Professional development	And also, during these summers, [FRTEP hosted] Sound of the Horse Youth Camp that came on with [the agent] and a few other guys, and I'm always in with the program. The youth were anywhere from nine all the way to 16 for the camp. We had three days, four days. And then they learn about the hoof care, and they learn about care for the horse and horsemanship, the whole thing. It was experience of all of that.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for farmers	Okay. All right. I always knew [the agent from the] veterinarian office. One day me and my wife we farm, what they call... Valley. [The agent] made an arrangement, for myself it was tours. But it was students that were bused in from different areas of the United States. They wanted to know what we do down in... Valley Farming, so we actually walked them through where we start our early cleaning with the canal, where we catch the water. We have to dig with our own shovels, the clay and silt from

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
		the canals, and it's a concrete canal. And everybody pitched in, because it's not only us that farms.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for future and new farmers and ranchers	It's really amazing as a journey when you start doing something that has to do with life. I was always told that animals and harvesting and everything is life, like livestock. So I went that way, and at the same time I learned, and at the same time I teach the young kids and young adults where they have to learn how to care for animals. In that journey, I went and met [the agent]. Well, I knew [the agent] as a youngster, when he was little, he's younger than me. But anyway, he went on to school and then learned a lot about livestock and what needs to be done as far as the education side. He's pretty well educated, and then he has a lot of knowledge as far as farming goes, and ranching.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for ranchers	Yeah. We were fortunate to have [the agent] in our area working out of Extension and a lot of the stuff that we're doing pretty much... a lot of the stuff started before my time. I retired as a consultant engineer back in 2016, because there was a demand for [me on the reservation] ... I was just going in and out trying to work with people here, the ranchers. And a lot of the guidelines came from [the agent]. And I had to go back. And I was really interested in... pretty much the product was here. [The agent] has been working with the people here. Majority of the animals were [a particular] type herd. So, I came back and I saw that and I just... There was a guy... and [the agent] talked about him. [He was doing some training on the reservation]. I teamed up with him and we implemented... at first it was a yield enhancement program where we enhanced the livestock yields and genetics and also some other stuff. From there, it led to partnership with different entities, and we call it [the Tribal] Beef Program.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for ranchers	And then [the agent] is very successful to our community. It's not only individual, it's [the] whole community. I have 187 permit holders. Permit means people that carry and have rights to graze on the reservation. So, there's 187 people that hold those permits, that have right to raise cattle on the reservation, sheep and also horses that are permitted.

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for ranchers	What [the agent] does, I invited him to my community several times to demonstrate beef and quality to the permit holders. It was very successful, because a lot of people, permit holders, they come back and give me feedback on it. They said they didn't know about those things, how to manage cattle out there. So, it was very successful. And now in my community I put in a range management plan for them so we can start writing for grants and stuff like that. And then also, in the history where we're working now, they had a cattle auction yard. They used to do that years' back, they used to have fall sales for cattle for marketing. Somewhere it faded away, and now I'm picking that back up, and help with [the agent]. On the 21 st we're going to have another beef and quality, and sure for the community that's going to be like another demonstration that we're planning on at the auction yard. And then I still go back and rely on [the agent] when there's time to time, and I get advice. And if I don't know some, I'll go back, and question and he'll answer my questions.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for ranchers	That's where I met a professor... from the University and also worked with... the veterinarian. They [did] a presentation in the... different chapters and around, so with the tool that [the agent] has, taking care of horses and as far as the mineral goes in the feed. I learned a lot from him and [his colleagues].
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for ranchers	I also did my own on-hands horse shoeing. With the help of [the agent], we did quite a few through the years. I think six years, six or seven years on, maybe 10, almost every summer different areas we did. And also, in there, there was a reproductive. [The agent's colleague from the University] came with a presentation of breeding mares, breeding horses, performance and different kind of breed that he had. So. With the teaching from them, it just opened my mind to everything, to what I was doing was the right thing. Which I'd gotten through natural balance and other forms of shoeing. And out of that, did my own research as far as the hoof goes, of how to care for them.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for ranchers	Yeah, sure. I worked with [the agent] maybe two or three times before. Beef quality assurance and FRTEP programs and whatnot. So yeah, he's invited me to some of the trainings on the outside. I've known [the agent] for quite some time. I've worked with [the agent] in a lot of areas, like I said. He comes out, I invite him to my permittee meetings, where we discuss issues like grazing, handbook

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
		regulations, livestock, herd management, land management and livestock management.
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Healthy food choices	These were heirloom seeds, nothing to do with HMO. These are organic stuff that's been hand down years after years, generation to generation, the seeds that we have. They were white corn, blue corn, yellow corn. And then we plant by hand, and we don't have any special tool to use. The other one was a variety of melons. Based on how I plant was by intervals, not only corn but melons too. The melons are like casabas, crestone, santa claras... I said these are all organic stuff, and they're sweet. This has nothing to do with what you had at grocery stores. The importance of this was we're health conscious, and these are all organic stuff. When you grow something, the greatest joy you ever have is when you start eating and harvesting your own corn or melons. That's the joy we get out of it.
Tribal Youth and 4-H	Life skills	Years back, back in 2003... I start[ed] a seminar out at my Dad's place..., and then I invited these different veterinarians, and [the agent] for his professional assistance. A lot in the community area came around, and we were doing it for mostly the youth. My last seminar was in 2008 or something like that, and within those years it really helped and uplifted a lot of youth and ranchers out there. And not only just beef and quality, [the agent] did a lot of horsemanship also, and then how to take care of horses, what kind of vaccination. Those are some things a lot of our youth need out there, and with this program it's very successful when you invite him out and he talks about these things.
Overall	Cultural understanding and respect	The agent is] very informative in a lot of ways, meaning that if he wants to go and talk to [Tribal members], he's very good in [our language] too so he can relate to a lot of the things that are happening out here, based on his experience in life. That's what I've come to notice about him. He does inform the people very well, and I think lots of people that he's worked with are very appreciative of the way he conducts himself when he does presentations.

